



EUROPEAN COMMISSION
HEALTH & CONSUMER PROTECTION DIRECTORATE-GENERAL

Directorate C - Scientific Opinions

UPDATE OF THE OPINION ON
TSE INFECTIVITY DISTRIBUTION IN RUMINANT TISSUES

INITIALLY ADOPTED BY
THE SCIENTIFIC STEERING COMMITTEE
AT ITS MEETING OF 10-11 JANUARY 2002
AND AMENDED AT ITS MEETING OF 7-8 NOVEMBER 2002

following the submission of (1) a risk assessment by the German Federal Ministry of Consumer Protection, food and Agriculture and (2) new scientific evidence regarding BSE infectivity distribution in tonsils

OPINION

At the end of 2001, the Scientific Steering Committee (SSC) was invited:

- (1) To update, on the basis of the most recent scientific data, the sheep tissue infectivity titre table presented in the SSC opinion of 22-23 July 1999 on The Policy of Breeding and Genotyping of Sheep;
- (2) To create a similar table for cattle on the basis of all available scientific evidence;
- (3) To consider whether any new evidence exists since the adoption of its opinion of 9 December 1997 on the listing of Specified Risk Materials which would indicate that the entire head of cattle, sheep and goats, including skeletal muscle, tongue and associated innervation should be considered as specified risk material.

The SSC invited the TSE/BSE *ad hoc* Group to prepare a scientific report that could serve as the basis for preparing an answer to the above question. A first report was finalised by the TSE/BSE *ad hoc* Group at its meeting of 13 December 2001 it served as the basis for an opinion adopted by the SSC at its meeting of 10-11 January 2002.

On 10 May 2002, the Government of the Federal Republic of Germany requested the European Commission to elicit the opinion of the Scientific Steering Committee on a report of 25 April 2002 prepared by the Federal Institute for Consumer Health Protection and Veterinary Medicine (BgVV), which evaluates the possible risks related to harvesting cheek meat and more specifically lists the critical hygiene points in harvesting of bovine heads and cheek meat of cattle. Whilst preparing this opinion, the SSC was informed about a recent outcome of the ongoing UK research, into the pathogenesis of BSE in cattle showing low levels of infectivity in bovine tonsil. In the light of these new data, the TSE/BSE *ad hoc* Group updated its report of 13 December 2001. This update report is attached and it served as the basis for the current update of the SSC opinion on TSE infectivity distribution in ruminant tissues. An English translation of the German report is also attached, for ease of reference (see **Annex 2** of the attached report).

The SSC adopts the following answers to the above questions:

(1) Tissue infectivity tables applicable for small ruminants.

Scrapie in small ruminants. There is no new evidence that became available since February 2001 and the SSC's therefore considers that the table attached to its pre-emptive risk assessment of 8-9 February 2001 remains valid. It is annexed as **Table 1** for ease of reference.

BSE in small ruminants. The SSC considers that, pending more experimental data becoming available, it would be prudent on the latest available evidence to adopt tabulations given at **Table 1** as being probably as representative of BSE as scrapie with regard to distribution and level of infectivity in tissues. However, the single and important exception is that lymphoreticular tissues in BSE in sheep should provisionally at least, be considered comparable in their level of infectivity with central nervous system tissues.

(2) Tissue infectivity tables related to BSE in cattle. Available data are incomplete and much of the information emanates from a single study of the distribution of infectivity after experimental oral exposure. Available incubation period assay values from the few tissues containing infectivity in experimentally exposed cattle suggests that in most of the infected tissues infectivity is close to the limit of detection of the assay, even in central nervous system. The early results of the re-evaluation of such tissues by bioassay in cattle compliment the mouse data, but such assays will not be completed for at least a further five years. Nevertheless, any further positive results would become available in that period. A tentative summary of available infectivity data for cattle with naturally acquired BSE is given at **Table 2** (Tissues with no infectivity from confirmed cases) and **Table 3** (Preliminary estimates of tissue infectivity after experimental and natural exposure).

(3) Possible consideration as specified risk material of the entire head of cattle, sheep and goats, including skeletal muscle, tongue and associated innervation.

Regarding *cattle* affected by or incubating BSE, the SSC considers that there is new evidence from tissue infectivity studies showing that certain head tissues (in

addition to: brain, eyes, dura mater, pituitary gland and skull) could possibly be regarded as SRM at least under certain circumstances. So far results of infectivity bioassays in cattle have supported the view that in the clinical disease stage of BSE, regional lymph nodes, including those of the head have no detectable infectivity. Furthermore, assay results of trigeminal ganglion suggest a low titre of infectivity only in the clinical disease stage, probably secondary to CNS involvement. However, whereas completed results of mouse bioassays of pituitary, cerebro-spinal fluid (CSF), the cranial cervical ganglion, facial nerve, tongue, salivary glands and several lymph nodes of the head from preclinical and clinical stages of experimental BSE in cattle have not revealed infectivity, there is now evidence from cattle-to-cattle transmission studies that the palatine tonsil may contain low levels of infectivity at an early stage of the incubation period and that this may affect the safe consumption of tongue if there is a risk of contamination of this tissue.

There is still no new infectivity data for cattle to suggest that skeletal muscle, tongue or associated nerves should be considered SRM at any age. However, the risk assessment carried out on behalf of the German authorities show that the SSC's initial statement that the "*Exclusion from SRM of bovine tongue and cheek meat remains justified providing contamination by CNS, introduced during slaughter, can be avoided*" may not necessarily be appropriate. That conclusion was reached considering the long list of critical points in the process of slaughtering the animal, the removal, storage and transport of the head and of the harvest of cheek meat.

On the basis of what precedes the SSC considers that:

- (1) the tonsil of a bovine animal of any age should be regarded as posing a risk.
- (2) the tongue of animals certified safe for human consumption does not pose a risk if contamination with CNS and tonsil material is avoided for animals of any age. This may imply that the harvested section of the tongue is shortened [to the "short tongue"], to avoid, by a cautious margin, removal with the tongue of that part of the root of the tongue containing lingual tonsil.
- (3) cheek meat of animals certified safe for human consumption, which is collected as part of a different process (**Annex 2**), does not pose a risk if a

wide range of precautions to avoid cross-contamination is taken. The feasibility of implementation of these precautions under field conditions may however be questioned and would in any case require to be previously verified.

With respect to *sheep*, there is involvement of lymphoid tissue of the head at an early stage of incubation in experimental BSE in sheep, consistent with the view that BSE in sheep has a pathogenesis with respect to tissue distribution of infectivity comparable with natural scrapie. Somatic peripheral nerve trunk infectivity, although categorised as “low” in scrapie, may be widespread in the carcass by the clinical disease stage. If, as seems likely, this results from “centrifugal” spread from the CNS and infectivity can be detected in the CNS in experimental BSE of sheep approximately 40-50% through the incubation period, infectivity may be present in somatic peripheral nerve fibres from this stage. These observations make it difficult to recommend an appropriate lower age limit for the exclusion of any head tissues of sheep if BSE were confirmed or considered likely in a given population.

Furthermore, the practicalities in slaughtering of small ruminants may necessitate removal of the entire head as SRM at all ages. Also, the risk of cross-contamination of tongue with tissues with likely infectivity from early in the incubation of BSE, with or without penetrative stunning, in small ruminants, is considered high.

Consequently, if BSE is considered to be present in sheep, the whole or entire head, including the tongue, of all ages of sheep should be included in the list of SRMs irrespective of slaughterhouse practices, until evidence to the contrary becomes available.

Very limited data are available for goats. The conclusions for sheep are therefore considered to be a reasonable approximation also for goats.

Table 1: Natural scrapie in sheep and goats: classification of tissues by agent titre in Swiss mice and by age, in pre-clinical and clinical cases of Scrapie in Suffolk sheep and in goats¹ (Re-edited but unammended from Annex: Opinion on The Policy of Breeding and Genotyping of Sheep, 22-23 July 1999) (EC 1999)

Infectivity titres*:
 A = high ($\geq 10^{4.0}$)
 B = medium ($10^{3.2} - 10^{4.0}$)
 C = low ($\leq 10^{3.2}$ or unknown)
 D = undetectable

Age (months)	PRE-CLINICAL				CLINICAL	
	≤ 8	10-14 ²	25	> 25	34-37	38-39
Numbers positive / examined	0/16	8/15	1/13	1/6	9/9	3/3
Brain					A	A
Brain (medulla)		D	C			
Brain (medulla / di-encephalon)			C			
Brain (cortex mid-brain)			D			
Pituitary					C	B
Spinal cord			D		A	A
Cerebro-spinal fluid					C	C
Sciatic nerve					C	C
Thymus	D		D		C**	C**
Thyroid					D	
Spleen	D	B	C		B	B
Tonsil	D	C	B		B	
Lymph node (RP/MP)	D	B	B		B	B
Lymph node (BM)		D	C		B	B
Lymph node (PS/PF)	D	C	C			
Lymph node (PF, 1/9 negative)					B	
Lymph node (PS, 2/9 negative)					B	
Lymph node (supra-mammary)			D		C	B
Colon-proximal		B	B		B	B
Colon-distal		D	D		C	C
Ileum	D					
Ileum-distal		B	B		B	
Ileum-proximal						B
Rectum-distal					B ⁺	B
Pancreas					C**	
Adrenal			D		C	C
Nasal mucosa			D		C	C

¹ After Hadlow et al. (1979, 1980, 1982), Pattison *et al.* (1964, 1972), Groschup et al. (1996). Regarding DRG: see Report.

² Techniques for the determination of infectivity become more and more sensitive. The age range may go below 10 months. In individual cases, tonsil infectivity has been detected in lambs of 16 weeks. Placenta has been placed in Group C, but titres are unknown.

Table 1 (continued): Natural scrapie in sheep and goats: classification of tissues by agent titre in Swiss mice and by age, in pre-clinical and clinical cases of Scrapie in Suffolk sheep and in goats¹ (Re-edited but unamended from Annex: Opinion on The Policy of Breeding and Genotyping of Sheep, 22-23 July 1999) (EC 1999)

Infectivity titres*: A = high ($\geq 10^{4.0}$)
 B = medium ($10^{3.2} - 10^{4.0}$)
 C = low ($\leq 10^{3.2}$ or unknown)
 D = undetectable

Age (months)	PRE-CLINICAL				CLINICAL	
	≤ 8	10-14 ³	25	> 25	34-37	38-39
Numbers positive / examined	0/16	8/15	1/13	1/6	9/9	3/3
Bone marrow					C**	D
Liver					C**	
Blood clot		D			D	D
Serum		D				D
Salivary glands			D		D	D
Saliva					D	
Muscle- skeletal					D	D
Heart					D	
Kidney					D	D
Lung					D	
Ovary					D	D
Uterus					D	D
Placenta					C** ^o	
Fetus					D	
Mammary gland					D	D
Colostrum				D		
Milk						D
Semen vesicle					D	
Testis					D	
Faeces		D				D

- * = Log₁₀ mouse intracerebral LD/50 per 30 mg tissues; (titres given as approximate ranges)
- ** = trace or exceptional
- + = Not assayed but high content of lymphoreticular tissue
- ° = negative in other studies
- MP = Mesenteric/portal
- PF = Prefemoral
- CSF = Cerebro-spinalfluid
- PS = Prescapular
- LN = Lymph node
- RP = Retropharyngeal
- BM = Bronchomediastinal

³ Techniques for the determination of infectivity become more and more sensitive. The age range may go below 10 months. In individual cases, tonsil infectivity has been detected in lambs of 16 weeks. Placenta has been placed in Group C, but titres are unknown.

Table 2: Tissues from confirmed cases of BSE in cattle in which no infectivity was detected by bioassay in mice injected both intracerebrally and intraperitoneally (Taken from Kimberlin, 1996)

<p><i>Nervous tissues</i> Cerebrospinal fluid Cauda equina Peripheral nerves : - sciaticus - tibialis - splanchnic</p>	<p><i>Lymphoreticular tissues*</i> Spleen Tonsil Lymph nodes - prefemoral - mesenteric - retropharyngeal</p>
<p><i>Alimentary tract</i> Oesophagus Reticulum Rumen (pillar) Rumen (oesophageal groove) Omasum Abomasum Proximal small intestine Distal small intestine Proximal colon Distal colon Rectum</p>	<p><i>Reproductive tissues</i> Testis Prostate Epididymis Seminal vesicle Semen Ovary Uterine caruncle Placental cotyledon Placental fluids : - amniotic fluid - allantoic fluid Udder Milk</p>
<p><i>Other tissues</i> Blood : - buffy coat - clotted - foetal calf - serum Bone marrow Fat (midrum) Heart Kidney</p>	<p>Liver Lung Muscle - semintendinous - diaphragma - longissimus - masseter Pancreas Skin Trachea</p>

* Tonsil was found positive in the cattle bio-assay – see opinion and attached report.

Table 3: Tentative summary of preliminary estimations* on classification of tissues of cattle according to infectivity after experimental oral or natural exposure to the agent of BSE.

Infectivity titres**:

A = high: $10^{3.0} - 10^{5.0}$ in mouse; $10^{5.7} - 10^{7.7}$ in cattle ***
 B = medium $10^{1.5} - 10^{3.0}$ in mouse; $10^{3.3} - 10^{5.6}$ in cattle ***
 C = low $\leq 10^{1.5}$ in mouse; $\leq 10^{3.2}$ in cattle ***
 D = undetectable
 ? = data not published

	EXPERIMENTAL				NATURAL
				Clinical	clinical
months after exposure	6-14	18	32	36-40	-
Brain			B / C	C	A
Retina					?
Spinal cord			C	C	A
Dorsal root ganglia			C	C	C
Trigeminal ganglion				C	
Ileum-distal	B / C	C		C	
Palatine tonsil	C [†]				
Lymph node (Retropharyngeal)					D
Lymph node (Mesenteric)					D
Lymph node (Popliteal)					D
For the list of tissues in which no detectable infectivity was found: see tables 1 and 2 of this opinion and table 5 and the Annex of the attached report.					

*. Refer to the report for further detail

** The classification used is preliminary and arbitrary because of a skewed range of infectivity in cattle with BSE compared to sheep with scrapie. It does not correspond to the Groups or Categories used in **Table 1**.

***. Values in bold in the table are based on bioassay in cattle.

† Preliminary evidence of estimated titre of $< 10^1$ in cattle



EUROPEAN COMMISSION
HEALTH & CONSUMER PROTECTION DIRECTORATE-GENERAL

Directorate C - Scientific Opinions

REPORT ON TSE INFECTIVITY DISTRIBUTION IN RUMINANT TISSUES (STATE OF KNOWLEDGE, DECEMBER 2001)

PREPARED BY THE TSE/BSE *AD HOC* GROUP

Initially finalised at its meeting of 13 December 2001 and updated at its meeting of 10 October 2002 following the submission of (1) a risk assessment by the German Federal Ministry of Consumer Protection, food and Agriculture and (2) new scientific evidence regarding BSE infectivity distribution in tonsils

Rapporteur: Dr.G.A.H.Wells

REPORT ON TSE INFECTIVITY DISTRIBUTION IN RUMINANT TISSUES (STATE OF KNOWLEDGE, OCTOBER 2001)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. Mandate	
II TSE infectivity levels in ruminant tissues	
II.1. Previous tabulated data	
II.2. Context of published data	
II.3. Scrapie in sheep : bioassays of sheep tissues after oral or natural exposure to the agent of scrapie by inoculation of mice	
II.4. BSE in cattle: bioassay of tissues from cattle experimentally infected with BSE agent and killed sequentially (VLA Pathogenesis study) by inoculation of mice.	
II.5. BSE in cattle: Bioassay of cattle tissues by inoculation of cattle	
II.6. BSE in sheep: Bioassays of sheep tissues after oral exposure to the agent of BSE by inoculation of mice.	
II.7. Conclusions	
II.7.1. TSEs in sheep (and goats)	
II.7.2. BSE in cattle:	
III. The safety of ruminant heads	
III.1. Infectivity in relation to incubation period	
III.1.1. Bovine	
III.1.2. Sheep	
III.2. Factors associated with age	
III.3. Factors associated with slaughter protocols	
III.4. Conclusions	
IV. Acknowledgements	
V. References	
Annex 1 Infectivity titres (bio-assayed in mice) in tissues from Suffolk sheep and goats, at the clinical stage of natural scrapie compared with the titres in tissues from confirmed cases of BSE.	
Annex 2: Harvesting of cheek meat of cattle. Specifically: List of critical hygiene points in harvesting of bovine heads and cheek meat of cattle (by Dr L. Ellerbroek and Dr I. Schütt-Abraham	

I. MANDATE

The Scientific Steering Committee (SSC) was invited:

- (1) To update, on the basis of the most recent scientific data, the sheep tissue infectivity titre table presented in the SSC opinion of 22-23 July 1999 on The Policy of Breeding and Genotyping of Sheep;
- (2) To create a similar table for cattle on the basis of all available scientific evidence;
- (3) To consider whether any new evidence exists since the adoption of its opinion of 9 December 1997 on the listing of Specified Risk Materials which would indicate that the entire head of cattle, sheep and goats, including skeletal muscle, tongue and associated innervation should be considered as specified risk material.

The SSC invited the TSE/BSE *ad hoc* Group to prepare a scientific report that could serve as the basis for preparing an answer to the above question. A first report was finalised by the TSE/BSE *ad hoc* Group at its meeting of 13 December 2001 it served as the basis for an opinion adopted by the SSC at its meeting of 10-11 January 2002.

On 10 May 2002, the Government of the Federal Republic of Germany requested the European Commission to elicit the opinion of the Scientific Steering Committee on a report of 25 April 2002 prepared by the Federal Institute for Consumer Health Protection and Veterinary Medicine (BgVV), which evaluates the possible risks related to harvesting cheek meat and more specifically lists the critical hygiene points in harvesting of bovine heads and cheek meat of cattle. Whilst preparing this opinion, the SSC was informed about a recent outcome of the ongoing UK cattle pathogenesis research, showing very low levels of infectivity in bovine tonsil. In the light of these new data, the TSE/BSE *ad hoc* Group updated its report of 13 December 2001. This update report is follows hereafter. An English translation of the German report is also attached as **Annex 2**, for ease of reference.

Keywords: Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy, Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathy, specified risk material, cattle, small ruminants, sheep, goat , head, tongue, tissue infectivity.

II TSE INFECTIVITY LEVELS IN RUMINANT TISSUES

II.1. PREVIOUS TABULATED DATA

The most recent tabulation of all available data with respect to classification of tissues from clinical cases of scrapie in Suffolk sheep and in goats on the basis of titre of infectivity after assay in mice was given as an annex in the Opinion on The Policy of Breeding and Genotyping of Sheep, Adopted 22-23 July 1999 (EC 1999), and is reproduced here at **Table 1**.

The sheep (Hadlow et al 1982) and sheep and goat data (Hadlow et al 1980) have also been compared previously with preliminary mouse infectivity data on tissues from naturally affected cases of BSE in cattle. This comparison is provided in **Annex**. A list of tissues, from cases of BSE affected cattle, in which no infectivity had at the time of writing been detected by bioassay in mice was also given in Kimberlin (1996) (See **Table 2**). A preliminary table of infectivity categories for tissues from sheep experimentally exposed orally to the BSE agent was given in Annex 3 of the Report attached to the Pre-emptive Risk Assessment should BSE in small ruminants be found under domestic conditions (See **Table 3**).

Table 1: Natural scrapie in sheep and goats: classification of tissues by agent titre in Swiss mice and by age, in pre-clinical and clinical cases of Scrapie in Suffolk sheep and in goats⁴ (Unammended from Annex: Opinion on The Policy of Breeding and Genotyping of Sheep, 22-23 July 1999) (EC 1999)

Group	Infectivity Titre (approx.range)	PRE-CLINICAL				CLINICAL	
		SHEEP				SHEEP	GOATS
		≤8 months.(0/16)	10-14 months(8/15) ⁵	25 months(1/13)	> 25 months(1/6)	34-57 months(9/9)	38-49 months(3/3)
A	HIGH ≥ 4.0					Brain Spinal cord	Brain Spinal cord
B	MEDIUM 3.2 – 4.0		Colon-proximal, Ileum-distal, LN (RP/MP), Spleen	Colon-proximal, Ileum- distal, LN (RP/MP), Tonsil		Colon-proximal, Ileum-distal, Spleen, Tonsil LN (BM), LN (PF, 1/9 negative), LN (PS, 2/9 negative), LN (PR/MP), (rectum-distal+),	Colon-proximal, Ileum- proximal, LN (BM), LN (RP/MP), LN (s.mammary), Pituitary, (Rectum-distal +), Spleen
C	LOW ≤ 3.2 or titre unknown		LN (PS/PF) Tonsil	Brain (medulla/ diencephalon), LN (BM), LN (PS/PF), Spleen		Adrenal, Bone marrow**, Colon-distal, CSF, Liver**, LN (s.mammary x2), Nasal mucosa, Pancreas **, Pituitary, Sciatic nerve, Thymus**,Placenta ** ^o	Adrenal, Colon-distal, CSF Nasal mucosa, Sciatic nerve, Thymus
D	Undetectable	Ileum, LN (PS/PF) LN (RP/MP), Thymus, Tonsil Spleen	Blood clot, brain (medulla), Colon- distal, Faeces, LN (BM), Serum	Adrenal, Brain (cortex mid-brain), Colon-distal, LN (s. mammary), Nasal mucosa, Salivary glands, Spinal cord, Thymus	Colostrum	Blood clot, Fetus, Heart, Kidney, Lung, Mammary gland, Muscle-skeletal, Ovary, Saliva, Salivary gland, Sem. Vesicle, Testis, Thyroid, Uterus	Blood clot, Bone marrow, Faeces, Kidney, Mammary gland, Milk, Muscle- skeletal, Ovary, Salivary gland, Serum, Uterus

(-/-) (Number positive / number examined)

* = Log₁₀ mouse intracerebral LD/50 per 30 mg tissues

+ = Not assayed but high content of lymphoreticular tissue

^o = negative in other studies

** = trace or exceptional

PF = Prefemoral

PS = Prescapular

RP = Retropharyngeal

MP = Mesenteric/portal

CSF = Cerebro-spinalfluid

LN = Lymph node

BM = Bronchomediastinal

⁴ After Hadlow et al. (1979, 1980, 1982), Pattison *et al.* (1964, 1972), Groschup et al. (1996). Regarding DRG: see text.

⁵ Techniques for the determination of infectivity become more and more sensitive. The age range may go below 10 months. In individual cases, tonsil infectivity has been detected in lambs of 16 weeks. Placenta has been placed in Group C, but titres are unknown.

Table 2: Tissues from confirmed cases of BSE in cattle in which no infectivity was detected by bioassay in mice injected both intracerebrally and intraperitoneally (Taken from Kimberlin, 1996)

<p><i>Nervous tissues</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cerebrospinal fluid Cauda equina Peripheral nerves : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - sciaticus - tibialis - splanchnic 	<p><i>Lymphoreticular tissues*</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Spleen Tonsil Lymph nodes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - prefemoral - mesenteric - retropharyngeal
<p><i>Alimentary tract</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Oesophagus Reticulum Rumen (pillar) Rumen (oesophageal groove) Omasum Abomasum Proximal small intestine Distal small intestine Proximal colon Distal colon Rectum 	<p><i>Reproductive tissues</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Testis Prostate Epididymis Seminal vesicle Semen Ovary Uterine caruncle Placental cotyledon Placental fluids : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - amniotic fluid - allantoic fluid Udder Milk
<p><i>Other tissues</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Blood : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - buffy coat - clotted - foetal calf - serum Bone marrow Fat (midrum) Heart Kidney 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Liver Lung Muscle <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - semintendinous - diaphragma - longissimus - masseter Pancreas Skin Trachea

* Tonsil was found positive in the cattle bio-assay (SEAC, 2002) – see elsewhere in this report.

Table 3: Experimental BSE in sheep: Distribution of infectivity by incubation stage and PrP genotype and stage of incubation (Taken from Annex 3 of the Pre-emptive Risk Assessment should BSE in small ruminants be found under domestic conditions, adopted by the SSC on 8-9 February 2001) (EC 2001) and updated from recent experimental results, see II.6.4 of Report

Infectivity titre	Pre-clinical		Clinical	
	ARR/ARR, ARR/ARQ	ARQ/ARQ	ARR/ARR, ARR/ARQ	ARQ/ARQ
High				Brain Spinal cord Spleen
Medium		Spleen Lymph nodes [estimated, not titrated] Tonsil		Lymph nodes Tonsil
Low				
PrP-res detected but infectivity not titrated		Intestine Forestomachs abomasum		Intestine Forestomachs abomasum
Not detectable	Brain, Spinal cord, Spleen, Lymph nodes, Tonsil			

Notes: The summary table is based on the limited research results currently available in this field. Full literature references are provided in the attached report. The table should be used with caution since it relates to experimental, and not natural BSE in sheep, some data are incomplete and some experiments are on-going. Nevertheless it may serve as a guide to the degrees of risk that may exist. The Table should be updated as new results come forward.

No PrP-res has so far been detected in ARQ/ARR or ARR/ARR animals inoculated with BSE up to 2 years post challenge. On the assumption that PrP-res and infectivity are correlated this would suggest that if these animals are infected the titre of infectivity in the years immediately following challenge is lower (or undetectable) in peripheral tissues of these genotypes than in more susceptible genotypes.

II.2. CONTEXT OF PUBLISHED DATA

The concentration of infectious TSE agent in tissue is determined by bioassay usually using endpoint titration or, sometimes, though regarded less accurate, by incubation time assay. The experimental models that have most often been used for such assays are inbred strains of mice. Whilst the most practical bioassay model, mice are likely to provide an underestimate of the concentration of agent in sheep or cattle tissues because of the effect of the species barrier. With few exceptions, previous titration data have been expressed in the form of \log_{10} ID₅₀ units according to Kärber (1931). One mean infective or lethal dose (ID₅₀) is defined as the amount of infectivity that will transmit disease to half of a group of inoculated animals. If 1 ml volumes of successive ten fold dilutions of a specimen are inoculated into a total of 20 mice per dilution group (0.05 ml per animal), one ID₅₀ would be present in the dilution that transmits disease to 50% (10/20) of the inoculated animals. Titrations often show transmission rates of about 100%, 50%, and 0% in successive 10-fold dilutions and providing the last, the limiting dilution, is determined, the survivorship can be used to calculate the units of ID₅₀ in the original undiluted inoculum volume. This is usually corrected to express the units of ID₅₀ /g of the tissue.

It must be stressed that experience of end point titration and incubation period assays in laboratory rodents suggests that the assays are most reproducible when examining infectivity of a strain of agent adapted or, ideally, cloned in the assay species. The inter-laboratory reproducibility of end point titration assays, at least with ME7 scrapie has been demonstrated in C57Bl mice (Taylor *et al.*, 2000). The recent use of mouse titrations of infectivity for cattle and sheep tissues is in contrast to this since the titrations have been conducted across a species barrier on primary inoculation from cattle or sheep.

There are a number of factors which affect the efficiency of infectivity assays. Route(s) of inoculation affect infectivity titre and dose response curves (Kimberlin and Walker, 1978). The volume(s) of inoculum injected also affects the sensitivity of the assay. In practice, the most efficient route(s) of inoculation are selected to perform the assay. In the assays cited in Tables 1 and 2, the calculated limit of detectability of scrapie infectivity by the intracerebral (i.c.) inoculation of mice is approximately $10^{2.0} \log_{10}$ mouse i.c. ID₅₀/g of tissue (Kimberlin 1994) with a volume of inoculum of 30 μ L. Clearly, the volume of inoculum that can be injected intracerebrally in a mouse is limited. In the mouse assays of infectivity of tissues from cases of naturally affected cattle with BSE (Fraser and Foster 1994 and H. Fraser, personal communication), shown in Table 3, a combination of i.c. and i.p. injections was used with a total volume of inoculum of 120 μ L, giving a limit of detectability of $10^{1.4}$ ID₅₀/g (Kimberlin 1996).

Fraser *et al* (1992) showed that end point titration of BSE on primary pass to RIII and C57Bl inbred mouse strains gave closely similar values for infectivity.

The relationship between incubation period and titre has been questioned by many authors (see Masel and Jansen 2001, for review), casting doubt on the validity of

estimating titre by incubation period assays. Certain physical and chemical treatments of scrapie affected mouse brain inocula may alter incubation relative to titre, giving a discrepancy between end point titration and incubation period assay of about 10^1 – 10^2 ID₅₀ (Masel and Jansen, 2001). In an analysis of over one hundred scrapie infectivity titrations in mice (McLean and Bostock 2000) a linear rise in mean incubation period with logarithmic decreasing dose was substantiated, but variability in incubation period rose linearly as dose decreased. Thus estimation of titre from dose response curves is less accurate at low doses.

While there are numerous instances of a poor correlation quantitatively between infectivity (depending on how it is measured) and concentration of PrP^{Sc} (Masel and Jansen, 2001), there are also reports demonstrating a relationship between PrP^{Sc} concentration and TSE infectivity (see Lee *et al.* 2001 for review). A “perfect correlation was observed between infectivity and PrP-res detection” (Race *et al.*, 1998) when mouse bioassay (Rocky Mountain Swiss mice) was compared with PrP immunoblotting for assay of brain, spleen, lymph nodes and placenta from scrapie affected Suffolk sheep. However, the nature of this comparison was confined to morbidity data and relative incubation period in the mouse assay (i.e. incubation period was not calibrated against a dose response curve) and presence of PrP-res. Thus in effect the comparison is essentially only qualitative.

Comparisons of the performance of the Bio-Rad version of the CEA Elisa test for rapid detection of PrP^{Sc} with mouse titration data for BSE affected bovine brain has indicated a good correlation, providing prospects for estimations of titre from such rapid test results (Deslys *et al.* 2001). This study was confined to brain tissue and rapid PrP tests are not yet available with suitable methodology for other than central nervous system tissue.

Nevertheless, increasing trend toward the use of PrP^{Sc} detection in preference to the time consuming bioassays as a diagnostic marker means that some examination of the measurement of PrP^{Sc} concentration as a proxy for infectivity should be considered where infectivity data *per se* is lacking. In this way for risk assessment purposes it may be possible to provide better estimates from current data rather than basing assessments purely on historical infectivity data. This has not, however, been pursued in the context of the present report and caution should be exercised in quantitation of PrP^{Sc} as a surrogate for infectivity assays. PrP^{Sc} can indeed indicate the presence of infectivity but in some species transmissions infectivity assays are still much more sensitive. Furthermore, the ratio of amounts of PrP^{Sc} to infectivity may vary. Strain of agent (TSE source), PrP genotype, breed of animal, tissue type and stage in the incubation period may all affect the relative amounts of infectivity to PrP^{Sc}.

The use of transgenic mice with modification to enhance the sensitivity of detection of the donor species infectivity may provide comparative data with assays conducted in conventional mice, but no comparative titration results are, as yet, available for such models (Buschmann *et al.*, 2000).

Titration of infectivity in TSE's have been performed largely on central nervous system tissue, notably brain. Recent data on other tissues is confined to a small number of experiments.

II.3. SCRAPIE IN SHEEP : BIOASSAYS OF SHEEP TISSUES AFTER ORAL OR NATURAL EXPOSURE TO THE AGENT OF SCRAPIE BY INOCULATION OF MICE

There are no recent titrations or incubation period data on tissues of sheep experimentally infected with scrapie via the oral route. Such data on natural cases of scrapie are confined to titres of brain tissue. A pool of 2867 brains of suspect scrapie cases used in a study of the effects of rendering upon the scrapie agent gave a titre of $10^{4.1}$ mouse (i.c. ID₅₀/g of tissue (Taylor *et al.* 1997) compared to the average titre of infectivity in brains of Suffolk sheep clinically affected with scrapie of 10^5 mouse (i.c.) ID₅₀/g (Hadlow and others, 1979). A pool of scrapie affected sheep brains used for the oral exposure of pigs to the scrapie agent gave widely differing infectivity values when titrated in different strains of mice. Titres were $10^{3.7}$ mouse (i.c. + i.p.) ID₅₀/g in IM mice compared to $10^{2.8}$ mouse (i.c. + i.p.) ID₅₀/g in C57BL mice (S.A.C. Hawkins, personal communication).

II.4. BSE IN CATTLE: BIOASSAY OF TISSUES FROM CATTLE EXPERIMENTALLY INFECTED WITH BSE AGENT AND KILLED SEQUENTIALLY (VLA PATHOGENESIS STUDY) BY INOCULATION OF MICE.

The study design has been described previously (Wells *et al.* 1996, Wells *et al.*, 1998). Briefly, forty Friesian/Holstein calves, born in 1991, were assembled from farms with no history of BSE. At four months of age, thirty were each dosed orally with 100g of pooled brain stems from seventy-five cases of BSE. Ten calves received no treatment and served as controls.

Clinical monitoring of cattle was maintained throughout the study to detect the onset of clinical disease.

Starting at six months of age, and then at four month intervals, until 22 months p.i., three challenged calves and one control calf were killed. Thereafter challenged and control cattle were killed at discretionary intervals, with the final kill at 40 months p.i.

Tissues were sampled aseptically for infectivity assays in mice. After each sequential kill, inocula were prepared from 44 tissues, representing principally the lymphoreticular system (LRS), the peripheral nervous system (PNS) and the central nervous system (CNS), alimentary tract, striated muscles and major viscera (see Table 3.1, Wells and others, 1996). All inocula were prepared as ten per cent suspensions in saline, with the inclusion of antibiotics for certain tissues. Single tissue inoculum pools were made from the exposed cattle at each time point. Inocula were similarly prepared but from single tissues of each control animal. Test and control inocula were injected by intracerebral (20µl) and intraperitoneal (100µl) routes into inbred mice for standard qualitative assay of infectivity. Inocula prepared from cattle killed up to 18 months p.i. were injected into RIII mice and/or C57Bl-J6 mice.

Qualitative assays by the i.c. and i.p. inoculation of mice (RIII and/or C57BL) of a large range of tissues from the UK VLA Pathogenesis study of BSE have been completed (Wells *et al.*, 1996, 1998, 1999 and unpublished data). No titration of infectivity in positive tissues has been carried out. For all tissues in which infectivity has not been detected it can be stated that they contain less than $10^{1.4}$ mouse (i.c./i.p.) \log_{10} LD₅₀/g. The results are summarised in **Table 4**.

Prospects for further analysis of the data from tissues in which infectivity has been detected to give an approximation to titre, must rely on survival data, dose and incubation period data for RIII and C57BL mice. The analyses of these data are as yet incomplete, particularly with respect to data on RIII mice (G.A.H. Wells and S.A.C. Hawkins, unpublished). Where data on incubation periods for RIII or C57BL mouse assays on tissues from the Pathogenesis Study of BSE is available, approximations to tissue infectivity titres have been estimated and provided in **Table 4**. These are necessarily provisional since most currently available values are from assays conducted in C57 BL mice, for which only a single experiment dose response curve result is available (on brain and after i.c. inoculation only). More values for incubation periods of RIII infectivity assays, on which titres can be estimated from summated data of a series of dose response curves (after i.c. + i.p. inoculations) will become available in the near future. [GW: *I will attempt to see if more information is now available and provide it at our next meeting*] From the available data it is not possible to estimate more accurately than the very low values of estimated infectivity ($<10^1$ mouse i.c. + i.p. ID₅₀/g) for the majority of the tissues of positive assays in the Pathogenesis study (**Table 4**).

A possible explanation for the very low estimates of infectivity in central nervous system may lie in the relatively early clinical status of cattle killed 32-40 months in the Pathogenesis Study. From a range of titrations conducted on brain from clinical or clinical suspect cases of BSE a wide range of titres have been obtained ($10^{2.9} - 10^{5.2}$ mouse i.c. or i.c + i.p) ID₅₀/g) (Fraser *et al* 1992, Taylor *et al* 1994, Kimberlin 1996, G. A. H. Wells and S.A.C. Hawkins, unpublished). It must be emphasised that this variation has to some extent a basis in sampling in that the highest titres were obtained from hind brain from single cases of terminally affected cattle, whereas the lowest titres were obtained from pools of whole brains from clinically suspect cases of BSE (which could contain $\geq 10\%$ negative cases)

Table 4. Summary of Results of Infectivity Assays in mice of Tissues from sequentially killed cattle exposed orally to the BSE agent. (S.A.C.Hawkins & G.A.H.Wells, unpublished)

Tissue		Infectivity	Estimate of range of titre of infectivity (mouse i.c./i.p. ID ₅₀ /g) relative to incubation period (months) of donor cattle
Neural:	Brain: frontal cortex, caudal medulla	+, +	[C57BL] ≤ 10 ^{1.0} (32-40m)
	Pituitary	-	
	Cerebrospinal fluid	-	
	Dura	N.D.	
	Spinal cord: C2-C3, T10-T11, L3-L4	+, +, +	
	Nodose ganglia	-	
	Dorsal root ganglia: C3-C6, T5-T8	+	
	Trigeminal ganglia	+	
	Stellate ganglia	-	
	Sciatic nerve	-	
	Facial nerve	-	
	Phrenic nerve	-	
	Radial nerve	N.D.	
	Semitendinosus muscle	N.D.	
	Diaphragmatic muscle	N.D.	
	Triceps muscle	-	
	Masseter muscle	N.D.	
Sternocephalicus muscle	-		
Longissimus dorsi muscle	-		
Alimentary:	Tongue (dorsum, include mucosa)	-	[RIII] < 10 ^{0.5} -10 ^{1.5} (6-14m), 10 ^{1.2} (18m) [C57BL] < 10 ¹ (36-40m)
	Submandibular salivary gland	-	
	Parotid salivary gland	-	
	Cranial esophagus	N.D.	
	Rumen	-	
	Omasum	N.D.	
	Abomasum (pyloric)	-	
	Duodenum	-	
	Distal ileum (inc. Peyer's patches)	+	
	Spiral colon	-	
	Faeces [‡]	-	
	Pancreas	-	
Liver	-		
Lymphoreticular:	Spleen	-	Note: Tonsil was found positive in the cattle bio-assay (SEAC, 2002) – see elsewhere in this report
	Thymus (cervical)	-	
	Tonsil	-	
	Submandibular lymph node	-	
	Retropharyngeal lymph node	-	
	Bronchial-mediastinal lymph node	-	
	Hepatic lymph node	-	
	Mesenteric lymph node	-	
	Prescapular lymph node	-	
Popliteal lymph node	-		
Other:	Kidney	-	[C57BL] < 10 ^{1.0} (38m)
	Urine [‡]	-	
	Adrenal	N.D.	
	Lung (left caudal lobe)	-	
	Nasal mucosa (midturbinate)	-	
	Pericardium [‡]	-	
	Heart (left ventricle/ septum)	-	
	Mitral valve [‡]	-	
	Aorta [‡]	-	
	Blood (buffy coat)	-	
	Blood (serum)	N.D.	
	Blood (clot)	N.D.	
	Bone marrow (sternum)	+ *	
	Collagen (Achilles tendon) [‡]	-	
	Skin [‡]	-	
Bone (femoral diaphysis) [‡]	-		

Key to Table 4:

+ positive

- negative (i.e. < 10^{1.4} mouse (i.c. + i.p.) log₁₀ LD₅₀/g)

N.D. Not Done (collected and reserved for future study)

[‡] Selected tissue assays in RIII mice conducted at only two kill time-points (18 and 32 months after exposure).

* Very low level of infectivity detected only at one time point (38 months after exposure) which is within the range of onset of clinical signs (end of incubation period) for cattle exposed in the study (Wells *et al* 1999)

II.5. BSE IN CATTLE: BIOASSAY OF CATTLE TISSUES BY INOCULATION OF CATTLE

In contrast to the widespread infectivity found in lymphoid tissues of cases of scrapie of sheep, the failure of the mouse bioassay to detect infectivity in tissues outwith the central nervous system of cattle naturally affected with BSE raised the issue of the efficiency of this assay system for the BSE agent. A study was therefore initiated (VLA/CSG SE1821) to provide a measure of the underestimation of the titre of infectivity in tissues across a species barrier in mice and to produce an approximate dose-incubation curve for infectivity of brain from BSE affected cattle by simultaneous titration of a primary inoculum in cattle and in mice. In addition, spleen and lymph node collected from natural cases of BSE were assayed in cattle to provide an order of magnitude estimate of concentration of infectivity in these tissues.

At approximately 4 months of age groups of calves were injected intracerebrally (i.c.) each with a single dilution of inoculum prepared from pooled brain stems from BSE affected cattle using a ten fold dilution range of 10^{-3} to 10^{-8} . Two additional groups of calves were similarly inoculated with a 10^{-1} dilution of a pool of spleen or lymph nodes. All calves were monitored clinically and retained until definite signs of clinical disease developed when they were killed and the brain examined to confirm the morphological phenotype of BSE and the presence of disease specific PrP by immunohistochemistry. A parallel titration in sinc^{s7} (RIII) mice was conducted according to standard mouse end point titration protocols over a dilution range of 10^{-1} to 10^{-6} . Mice were inoculated by the i.c. and intraperitoneal (i.p.) routes simultaneously to maximise the efficiency of the assay.

Brain titres of $10^{3.3}$ mouse (i.c. + i.p.) ID_{50}/g and $10^{6.0}$ cattle (i.c.) ID_{50}/g were established. The resultant value of the underestimation of the infectivity titre of BSE tissue when titrated across a species barrier in mice is therefore a factor of 500 fold (G.A.H.Wells and S.A.C.Hawkins, unpublished data). Expressed as relative titres, 10^0 mouse (i.c./i.p.) LD_{50}/g is equivalent to $10^{2.7}$ cattle (i.c.) LD_{50}/g , or the limit of detection of the mouse bioassay (at approximately $10^{1.4}$ mouse [i.c./i.p.] LD_{50}/g) is equivalent to $10^{4.1}$ cattle [i.c.] LD_{50}/g . Additional assays of selected tissues from the original pathogenesis study by intracerebral inoculation of cattle initially confirmed infectivity only in certain tissues which were already found to be positive by the mouse bioassay. However, recent results (SEAC, 2002) show the presence of low levels of infectivity in bovine tonsil from cattle 10 months after experimental oral exposure to BSE infection. So far only 1 of the group of 5 intracerebrally inoculated recipient cattle has developed disease. SEAC (2002), considered that this finding was unlikely to be an experimental artefact or due to residual infectivity in inoculum. An overall review of the results of additional assays of selected tissues, from the pathogenesis study, by intracerebral inoculation of cattle (as of August 2002) is presented in **Table 5** (G.A.H.Wells and S.A.C.Hawkins, unpublished data).

That the relative degree of insensitivity of the mouse bioassay could explain the apparent absence of widespread LRS infectivity in BSE is not supported by the

results of assays by intracerebral inoculation of cattle with pooled lymph nodes (retropharyngeal, mesenteric and popliteal) or pooled spleens from five terminal clinical cases of BSE. In this study survival data suggested that, if present, the concentration of infectivity in these tissues was, at least, less than one, and possibly less than 0.1 cattle (i.c) LD₅₀/g.

Table 5: Bioassay of tissues from cattle exposed orally to BSE agent (Pathogenesis Study) by intracerebral inoculation of cattle (5 per inoculum group): details of inocula, according to sequential kill point of source cattle, inocula and inoculation dates.

Inoculum (months p.i.)	Date of inoculation	Survival time ⁴ (months) up to 29/8/02
Skeletal muscle ¹ (18m p.i.)	18.10.96	71
Liver (18m p.i.)	4.11.96	71
Kidney (18m p.i.)	6.11.96	71
Distal ileum (18m p.i.)	7.11.96	Mean incubation period 24 (5/5⁵)
Skeletal muscle ¹ (32m p.i.)	11.11.96	70
Liver (32m p.i.)	13.11.96	70
Kidney (32m p.i.)	14.11.96	70
Peripheral nerve ² (32m p.i.)	9.12.96	69
Buffy coat (32m p.i.)	12.12.96	69
Caudal medulla/spinal cord (32m p.i.)	23.2.98	Mean incubation period 23 (5/5)
Distal ileum (32m p.i.)	25.2.98	55
Caudal medulla/spinal cord (22 m p.i.)	27.2.98	55
Thymus (6m p.i.)	6.4.98	53
Distal ileum (10m p.i.)	8.4.98	Mean incubation period 22 (5/5)
Skin (32m p.i.)	24.4.98	53
Caudal medulla (10m p.i.)	27.4.98	53
Caudal medulla/spinal cord (26m p.i.)	30.4.98	53
Spinal cord (10m p.i.)	28.5.98	52
Spleen (10m p.i.)	9.7.98	50
Tonsil (10m p.i.)	27.8.98	45† (1/5)
Thymus (10m p.i.)	1.9.98	49
Kidney (6m p.i.)	4.9.98	49
Liver (6m p.i.)	21.9.98	48
Skeletal muscle (6m p.i.)	22.9.98	48
Regional lymph nodes ³ (6m p.i.)	24.11.98	46
Peripheral nerve ² (6m p.i.)	26.11.98	46
Buffy coat (6m p.i.)	30.11.98	45
Spleen (6m p.i.)	2.12.98	45
Tonsil (6m p.i.)	3.12.98	45
Distal ileum (6m p.i.)	22.12.98	Mean incubation period 27 (5/5)
Mesenteric lymph nodes (6m p.i.)	23.12.98	45
Caudal medulla (6m p.i.)	5.1.99	44
Spinal cord (6m p.i.)	7.1.99	44
Peripheral nerve ² (18m p.i.)	11.1.99	44
Buffy coat (18m p.i.)	12.1.99	44
Regional lymph nodes (18m p.i.)	13.1.99	44
Salivary gland (18m p.i.)	19.1.99	44
Skin (18m p.i.)	21.1.99	44
Mesenteric lymph nodes (18m p.i.)	26.1.99	44
Spleen (18m p.i.)	28.1.99	43
Tonsil (18m p.i.)	2.2.99	43
Caudal medulla (18m p.i.)	9.2.99	43
Spinal cord (18m p.i.)	10.2.99	43
Skeletal muscle ¹ (26m p.i.)	11.2.99	43
Regional lymph nodes (26m p.i.)	12.2.99	43
Liver (26m p.i.)	16.2.99	43

Table 5: Bioassay of tissues from cattle exposed orally to BSE agent (Pathogenesis Study) by intracerebral inoculation of cattle (5 per inoculum group): details of inocula, according to sequential kill point of source cattle, inocula and inoculation dates (continued)

Inoculum (months p.i.)	Date of inoculation	Survival time ⁴ (months) up to 29/8/01
Kidney (26m p.i.)	18.2.99	43
Distal ileum (26m p.i.)	19.2.99	43
Peripheral nerve ² (26m p.i.)	22.2.99	43
Buffy coat (26m p.i.)	23.2.99	43
Salivary gland (26m p.i.)	25.2.99	43
Skin (26m p.i.)	1.3.99	42
Mesenteric lymph nodes (26m p.i.)	2.3.99	42
Spleen (26m p.i.)	10.3.99	42
Tonsil (26m .i.)	11.3.99	42
Caudal medulla (26m p.i.)	15.3.99	42
Spinal cord (26m p.i.)	16.3.99	42
Bone marrow (32m p.i.)	18.3.99	42
Bone marrow (22m p.i.)	24.3.99	42
Bone marrow (36m p.i.)	29.3.99	41
Bone marrow (26m p.i.)	31.3.99	41
Urine (18m p.i.)	17.8.99	37
Nictitating membrane (field case material)	13.3.00	30

¹ Pool of semitendinosus, longissimus dorsi and masseter muscles

² Pool of sciatic and radial nerves

³ Pool of prescapular and popliteal lymph nodes

⁴ Survival time of animals remaining in the experiment rounded to nearest whole month (see text)

⁵ No. cattle developing clinical disease/no. inoculated

† Incubation period of single affected recipient. Survival period of remaining 4 recipients in group (at August 29/8/02) is 49 months

From a titration of a pool of BSE affected bovine brain tissue by intracerebral inoculation of cattle a dose/incubation curve has been produced from which it may be possible to obtain an approximation of the titre of an inoculum by reference to incubation period data for that tissue. From the available data to date on the bioassay of Pathogenesis study tissues in cattle, tissues containing infectivity are: distal ileum, 6 m.p.i., 10 m.p.i. and 18 m.p.i. and brain stem/spinal cord, 32 m.p.i. The mean incubation periods for the tissues at these time points, when estimated from the dose/incubation curve for the cattle titration suggest titres of 10^1 - 10^2 (6.m.p.i.), 10^3 (10 m.p.i.), 10^2 - 10^3 (18 m.p.i.) and 10^2 - 10^3 (32 m.p.i.) respectively. This corresponds very approximately to RIII mouse incubation period data in as much as by the mouse bioassay a rising titre (reducing mean incubation) was indicated by the results of distal ileum assay from cattle 6 months and 10 months after exposure and a plateau of incubation period in mice inoculated with distal ileum from cattle 18 months after exposure. The estimated values in certain instances do however show up to a 1 \log_{10} discrepancy between the cattle and mouse infectivity data when estimations are compared

between those calculated on the basis of the cattle i.c. titration dose-response regression curve and those derived from extrapolation from an anticipated 500 fold increased sensitivity over the mouse bioassay. Discrepancies between infectivity estimates by cattle ic titration and extrapolation from the mouse assays fall within the range of experimental error and the values can only be regarded as indicative of general trends.

If one considers the currently available survival times for inoculated cattle in this cattle assay (**Table 5**) it becomes clear that, should there be any infectivity in the remaining tissue groups it would already (as of August 2002) be $<10^1$ cattle i.c. ID₅₀/g for most and considerably lower for some groups. A preliminary summary of infectivity classification for cattle tissues is given in **Table 6**.

II.6. BSE IN SHEEP: BIOASSAYS OF SHEEP TISSUES AFTER ORAL EXPOSURE TO THE AGENT OF BSE BY INOCULATION OF MICE.

II.6.1. The report attached to the *Opinion of the SSC on Specified Risk Materials of Small Ruminants, adopted 13-14 April 2000* (EC 2000) states that from early results of the transmission of BSE to sheep studies (Sheep BSE pathogenesis experiment, carried out by the UK Institute for Animal Health -IAH) some ARQ/ARQ infected sheep have widespread PrP^{Sc} demonstrable in the lymphoreticular system tissues from 16 months after exposure, but there are, as yet, no corresponding bioassay results for infectivity. The report also stresses that this does not exclude finding infectivity or PrP^{Sc} at other (including younger) ages. Additional evidence, not cited in that report (Somerville *et al.*, 1997) demonstrated PrP^{Sc} in spleens of some QQ₁₇₁ Cheviot sheep infected with BSE.

The IAH sheep BSE pathogenesis experiment is ongoing. Immunocytochemical studies of tissues animals succumbing to BSE have been published (Foster *et al.*, 2001). The 7 animals that succumbed to BSE (6 are still alive) all showed PrP^{Sc} immunostaining in CNS and LRS tissues but not elsewhere. While the published results provide information only on clinical cases of experimental BSE in ARQ/ARQ Cheviot sheep (mean incubation period approximately 25 months after exposure to 5g oral dose) it is important to note that tissues from most major organs, including heart, lung, liver or thymus, showed no PrP^{Sc} immunostaining. Minimal staining was seen in glomeruli of the kidney. No evidence of PrP^{Sc} was found in any of the skeletal muscles tested, nor in reproductive tissues or skin.

It is of interest also that of the peripheral nerves examined (vagus, radial, sciatic) only the vagus, which has been proposed by many as implicated in the pathogenesis of scrapie after oral exposures, and not the somatic peripheral nerves, showed PrP^{Sc} immunostaining. Infectivity assays on a range of tissues from these animals are in progress. Studies on animals killed at intermediate times throughout the incubation period are not complete. Preliminary data support the findings of Jeffrey *et al.* (2001) which suggest that in some animals evidence of the presence of TSE infectivity (e.g. PrP^{Sc} immunostaining) can be detected in some lymphoid tissues from early on after infection.